1		•	
1	David Bush, State Bar No. 154511 Jennifer Henry, State Bar No. 208221		
2	BUSH & HENRY ATTORNEYS AT LAW		
3	4400 Keller Avenue, Suite 200 Oakland, CA 94605		
4	Tel: (510) 577-0747		
5	Clifford A. Chanler, State Bar No. 135534 CHANLER LAW GROUP		
6	Magnolia Lane (off Huckleberry Hill) New Canaan, CT 06840-3801		
7	Tel: (203) 966-9911		
8	Attorneys for Plaintiff MICHAEL DIPIRRO		
9			
10	SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA		
11	IN AND FOR THE COUNTY OF ALAMEDA, HAYWARD BRANCH		
12	UNLIMITED CIVIL JURISDICTION		
. 13	MICHAEL DIPIRRO,	No. 01-032306	
14	Plaintiff,)	
15	·	SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT	
16	v .	SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT	
17	MARKWINS INTERNATIONAL; and DOES 1 through 1000,		
18	Defendants.		
- 19			
	This Settlement Agreement ("Agreement" or "Settlement Agreement") is entered into		
20			
21	by and between Michael DiPirro and Markwins International, a California corporation		
22			
23	Charles Ly Carping V Corners Carp and		
24	SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT		
25	1 SF1/120871.3/THC		
	·		

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23

("Markwins") as of December 10, 2001 (the "Effective Date"). The parties agree to the following terms and conditions:

WHEREAS:

- A. Michael DiPirro is an individual residing in San Francisco, California, who seeks to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals and improve human health by reducing or eliminating hazardous substances contained in consumer and industrial products;
- B. Markwins is a company that currently manufactures and distributes certain eyeshadows, blushes, lipsticks, lip liners and cosmetic kits (which contain two or more cosmetic items) that are alleged to contain lead (or lead compounds), a substance known to the State of California to cause birth defects (or other reproductive harm) (the "Listed Chemical");
- C. On October 11, 2000, Michael DiPirro first served Markwins and other public enforcement agencies with a document entitled "60-Day Notice of Violation" which provided Markwins and such public enforcers with notice that Markwins was in violation of Health & Safety Code §25249.6 for allegedly failing to warn purchasers that certain products it sells in California expose users the Listed Chemical; and
- D. On November 28, 2001, Michael DiPirro filed a complaint entitled

 Michael DiPirro v. Markwins International, et al. in the Alameda County Superior Court,

 naming Markwins as a defendant and alleging violations of Business & Professions Code

 §17200 and Health & Safety Code §25249.6 in the interest of the general public in California

SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT

who allegedly have been exposed to the Listed Chemical contained in certain products that Markwins sells.

E. Nothing in this Agreement shall be construed as an admission by Markwins of any fact, finding, issue of law, assertion, allegation or violation of law, nor shall compliance with this Agreement constitute or be construed as an admission by Markwins of any fact, finding, conclusion, issue of law, or violation of law. However, this paragraph shall not diminish or otherwise affect the obligations, responsibilities, and duties of Markwins under this Agreement.

NOW THEREFORE, MICHAEL DIPIRRO AND MARKWINS AGREE AS FOLLOWS:

- 1. Reformulation Commitment. Markwins shall reformulate the Products so as to eliminate the presence of lead as follows:
- 1.1. Reformulation Timetable. Beginning immediately, Markwins shall initiate or otherwise arrange for diligent efforts to be undertaken to revise the Product's formulations so as to eliminate the presence of lead, as that phrase is defined in paragraph 1.4, below. As of July 31, 2002, Markwins agrees not to manufacture or sell (or cause to be manufactured or sold on its behalf) any of the Products unless each such Product has been manufactured so as to eliminate the presence of lead, as that phrase is defined in paragraph 1.4, below.
- 1.2. Warning Commitment. Although Markwins intends to reformulate the Products, as discussed in paragraph 1.1 above, in the event that Products are manufactured or sold by Markwins in California that still contain lead, as that phrase is defined in paragraph

SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT

1.4, below, after July 31, 2002, Markwins agrees that such Products shall comply with section 1.3, below.

1.3. Health Hazard Statement.

¶1.3.A. For all Products containing lead (or lead compounds), such Products shall bear the following warning statement:

"WARNING: This product contains lead, a chemical known to the State of California to cause birth defects (or other reproductive harm)."

The warning statement shall be prominently placed on the Products label with such conspicuousness, as compared with other words, statements, designs or devices, by way of adhesive sticker or otherwise printed on the label, as to render it likely to be read and understood by an ordinary individual under customary conditions of purchase or use.

1.3.B. Product Characterization. Markwins acknowledges that plaintiff asserts that each of the Products listed in Exhibit A contains lead (or lead compounds) and Plaintiff alleges that the customary use or application of the Products is likely to expose users to lead (or lead compounds), a substance known to the State of California to birth defects (or other reproductive harm). In the event that Markwins obtains analytical, risk assessment or other data ("Exposure Data") that shows an exposure to any or all Products will have "no observable effect," as such standard is applicable and as is defined under Health & Safety Code §25249.10(c) and Markwins seeks to eliminate the warnings, as set forth herein, then Markwins shall provide DiPirro with ninety (90) days prior written notice of its intent to limit or eliminate the warning provisions under this Agreement based on the Exposure Data and

SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT

20

21

22

23

24

25

shall provide DiPirro with all such supporting Exposure Data. Within ninety (90) days of receipt of Markwins Exposure Data, DiPirro shall provide Markwins with written notice of his intent to challenge the Exposure Data (in the event that he chooses to make such a challenge). If DiPirro fails to provide Markwins written notice of his intent to challenge the Exposure Data within ninety (90) days of receipt of Markwins' notice and the Exposure Data, DiPirro shall waive all rights to challenge the Exposure Data, and Markwins shall be entitled to limit or eliminate the warning provisions required under this Agreement with respect to those Product(s) to which the Exposure Data applies. If DiPirro timely notifies Markwins of his intent to challenge the Exposure Data, DiPirro and Markwins (a) may stop its efforts to eliminate the warnings upon notice to DiPirro with no further liability or obligations or (b) shall negotiate in good faith for a period not to exceed thirty (30) days following receipt of Markwins' notice to attempt to reach a settlement of this issue. If a settlement is not reached, DiPirro and Markwins agree to submit such challenge to the Superior Court for determination, pursuant to the court's continuing jurisdiction of this matter under C.C.P. §664.6 and this Agreement. The prevailing party shall be entitled to reasonable attorneys' fees and costs associated with bringing a motion brought under this paragraph to the court for determination.

Lead Content. Through reformulation, Markwins intends to 1.4. completely eliminate the presence of lead in the Products. Markwins asserts, however, that it may be impossible to remove all detectable amounts of lead from the Products. Therefore, for purposes of this Settlement Agreement, the presence of lead shall be deemed to be eliminated in the Products according to the following schedule: 1) no lipstick shall contain

greater than .35 parts per million (ppm) of lead; and 2) no other cosmetic item, including eye shadows and blushes, shall contain greater than .5 parts per million (ppm) of lead. Markwins shall use EPA testing methodology 6020 or 6010 to determine whether the respective levels have been exceeded in their cosmetic products. The parties agree that Markwins may modify the test method so long as: 1) the method is appropriate under 22 CCR §12901; and 2) DiPirro is provided 30 day written notice of the requested modification. Consent by DiPirro to such modification shall not be unreasonably withheld.

2. Payment Pursuant To Health & Safety Code §25249.7(b).

Pursuant to Health & Safety Code §25249.7(b), Markwins shall pay a civil penalty of \$115,000 (one hundred fifteen thousand dollars) in two installments. The first payment of \$25,000 (twenty five thousand dollars) shall be paid within fifteen (15) calendar days after the Effective Date of this Agreement and shall be held by DiPirro's counsel in his firm trust account until the Alameda County Superior Court approves and enters the Settlement Agreement.

The second payment of \$90,000 (ninety thousand dollars) shall be made on or before September 1, 2002. However, the second payment shall be waived if Markwins reformulates its Products to eliminate the presence of lead (as defined in paragraph 1.4, above) by July 31, 2002. In order to receive a waiver of the second penalty payment, a written statement from Markwins or its counsel stating that reformulation has been completed must be provided to DiPirro no later than August 15, 2002.

The penalty payments are to be made payable to "Chanler Law Group In

Trust For Michael DiPirro". Penalty monies shall be apportioned by DiPirro in accordance

SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT

with Health & Safety Code §25192, with 75% of these funds remitted to the State of California's Department of Toxic Substances Control. If the Settlement Agreement is not approved by the Court, DiPirro will return all funds, with interest thereon at a rate of six percent (6%) per annum, within ten (10) calendar days of notice of the Court's decision.

Markwins understands that the payment schedule as stated in this Settlement Agreement is a material factor upon which DiPirro has relied in entering into this Settlement Agreement. Markwins agrees that all payments will be made in a timely manner in accordance with the payment due dates. Markwins will be given a five (5) calendar day grace period from the date payment is due. Markwins agrees to pay Michael DiPirro a \$250 per calendar day fee for each day the payment is not received after the grace period ends. For purposes of this paragraph, each new day (requiring an additional \$250 payment) will begin at 5 p.m. (PST).

3. Reimbursement Of Fees And Costs. The parties acknowledge that DiPirro offered to resolve the dispute without reaching terms on the amount of fees and costs to be reimbursed, thereby leaving this open issue to be resolved after the material terms of the agreement had been reached, and the matter settled. Markwins then expressed a desire to resolve the fee and cost issue concurrently with other settlement terms, so the parties tried to (and did) reach an accord on the compensation due to DiPirro and his counsel under the private attorney general doctrine codified at C.C.P. §1021.5.

Markwins shall reimburse DiPirro and his counsel for his fees and costs, incurred as a result of investigating, bringing this matter to Markwins' attention, litigating and negotiating a settlement in the public interest. Markwins shall pay \$125,000 (one

SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT

hundred twenty five thousand dollars), except as provided for in paragraph 3.1 below, for all attorneys' fees, expert and investigation fees, and litigation costs. Markwins agrees to pay the total sum of \$125,000, except as provided for in paragraph 3.1 below, within fifteen (15) calendar days of the Effective Date. Such sum shall be held by DiPirro's counsel in his firm trust account until the Alameda County Superior Court approves and enters the Settlement Agreement. If the Settlement Agreement is not approved by the Court, DiPirro will return all funds, with interest thereon at a rate of six percent (6%) per annum, within ten (10) calendar days of notice of the Court's decision. Payment should be made payable to the "Chanler Law Group".

Markwins understands that the payment schedule as stated in this Settlement Agreement is a material factor upon which DiPirro has relied in entering into this Settlement Agreement. Markwins agrees that all payments will be made in a timely manner in accordance with the payment due dates. Markwins will be given a five (5) calendar day grace period from the date payment is due. Markwins agrees to pay Michael DiPirro a \$250 per calendar day fee for each day the payment is not received after the grace period ends. For purposes of this paragraph, each new day (requiring an additional \$250 payment) will begin at 5 p.m. (PST).

3.1 Additional Contingent Fees and Costs. In the event that the California Attorney General's Office, pursuant to 11 CCR Section 3000, et seq., serves objections to this Settlement Agreement on either of the parties, such that it requires plaintiff to incur additional legal fees or costs relating to this Settlement Agreement, Markwins shall reimburse DiPirro for any fees and costs incurred by DiPirro and his counsel in excess of

\$1,500, but in any case no higher than \$7,000 above the initial \$1,500, from the date of receipt of the Attorney General's objections. Such additional legal fees or costs relating to this Settlement Agreement include, but are not limited to: further editing and finalizing of the Settlement Agreement; corresponding with opposing counsel; retention of experts; presenting of the Settlement Agreement (or any modifications thereof) to the Attorney General for further comment; and any briefing and/or appearance before the Court related to this Settlement Agreement.

Plaintiff agrees to document all fees and costs incurred from the date of receipt of the Attorney General's objections through the date of court approval of the Settlement Agreement. Prior to receiving such documentation, Markwins agrees to enter into a letter agreement in which the parties agree that, by transmitting such information, no privilege will be waived by DiPirro or his counsel.

Such additional reimbursement of legal fees and costs shall be due within ten (10) calendar days after receipt of both notice of Court approval of the Settlement Agreement and final billing statement from plaintiff. Markwins has the right to object to such reimbursement and may submit the resolution of this issue to the American Arbitration Association (AAA) in Northern California to determine the reasonableness of the additional fees and costs sought, provided that such notice of objection or decision to arbitrate is received by plaintiff by the end of the ten (10) calendar days. If an arbitration notice is not filed with AAA in a timely manner, DiPirro may file a motion with the Court for fees and costs pursuant to CCP §1021.5 and this Settlement Agreement associated with any additional fees and costs incurred as set forth in this paragraph.

- -19

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17

4. Michael DiPirro's Release Of Markwins. Michael DiPirro, by this Agreement, on behalf of himself, his agents, representatives, attorneys, assigns and in the interest of the general public, waives all rights to institute or participate in, directly or indirectly, any form of legal action, and releases all claims, liabilities, obligations, losses, costs, expenses, fines and damages, against Markwins and its distributors, retailers (including, but not limited to, Wal-Mart Co. Inc.; J.C. Penny Company, Inc.; Walgreen Co., Inc.; Macy's; Nordstrom Inc.; Sears; and Mervyn's), customers, directors, officers, employees, successors and assigns, whether under Proposition 65' or the Business & Profession Code §17200 et seq. based on Markwins' alleged failure to warn for cancer or reproductive toxicity caused by exposure to the Listed Chemical contained in any of the Products. With respect to DiPirro v. Wal-Mart (Alameda County Superior Court No. H217587-0), plaintiff will dismiss the case without prejudice within five (5) business days of receiving the approval of this Settlement Agreement from the Court.

5. Markwins' Release Of Michael DiPirro. Markwins, by this Agreement, waives all rights to institute any form of legal action against Michael DiPirro and his attorneys or representatives, for all actions or statements made by Michael DiPirro, and his attorneys or representatives, in the course of seeking enforcement of Proposition 65 or Business & Profession Code §17200 against Markwins.

6. Court Approval. If, for any reason, this Settlement Agreement is not approved by the Court, this Agreement shall be deemed null and void.

21

20

18

-19

22

23

24

I I SF1/120871.3/THC

25

this Sertiament Agreement on, the California Americay General's Office within two business days after the parties execute this Settlement Agreement. Policyring the explication of the Attorney General's thirty-day review period, counsel for Differe shall subsuit the Sectlement Agreement to the Court in accordance with the requirements of Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(f) and its implementing regulations, thereby allowing the Attorney General to serve any comments to this Sectlement Agreement prior to the end of the thirty (30) day period.

- 12. Counterparts and Facilinite. This Agreement may be executed in counterparts and facsimile, each of which shall be deemed an original, and all of which, when taken together, shall constitute one and the same document.
- 13. Authorization. The undersigned are authorized to execute this
 Agreement on behalf of their respective parties and have read, understood and agree to all of
 the terms and conditions of this Agreement.

DATE: DATE:

Michael Dillyto PLAINTEF Markwins International
DEFENDANT

SETTLEMENT ACREEMENT

REMINISTRATION OF THE